

'A New Ally has come to the Cause': The Manx Language Society and the Early Sound

Recording of Manx Gaelic

Stephen Miller

The Isle of Man is 571 km² in extent and located in the north of the Irish Sea. The last remnant of the Norse-ruled Kingdom of Man and the Isles, which ended in 1265 and brought into the English orbit in 1414, retains its self-governance, and today is a Crown Dependency of the United Kingdom. The Norse period in the Island is seen in place- and surnames, and Tynwald, the Manx parliament. The economy was one of subsistence farming and fishing in the main, until lead mining and Irish mackerel fishing developed in the nineteenth century, though both were close to collapse by the turn of the nineteenth century.¹

It was not only fishing and mining that were in decline, so too were the Manx. In 1891, some 55,608 inhabitants were enumerated; a decade later in 1901, it dropped to 54,752. As the *Isle of Man Examiner* wrote in 1900 of the parish of Jurby in the agricultural north of the Island, 'Jurby's population, like its foreshore, is alarmingly on the decrease'.² Emigration had long been a feature of Manx life, with obituaries from the Ohio *Cleveland Plain Dealer* appearing in the Manx newspapers, showing where most ended up in America. Only Douglas, now the Island's capital, was flourishing due to the tourist trade, the town being the main holiday destination for the working class of Lancashire.

The Island's identity and sense of self had been shored up in print in the *fin-de-siècle* by the polymath A.W. Moore (1853–1909), antiquarian and Manx statesman, with publications such as *The Surnames and Place Names of the Isle of Man* (1890), *Folk-Lore of*

¹ John Belchem, 'The Onset of Modernity, 1830–80', *The Modern Period: 1830–1999*, vol. 5, A New History of the Isle of Man (Liverpool University Press, 2000).

² Anon, 'Jurby's population ...', *Isle of Man Examiner*, 18 August 1900, 4c.

the Isle of Man (1891), *Carvalyn Gailckagh* (1891), *Manx Ballads and Music* (1896), and culminating in his two-volume *History of the Isle of Man* (1900).³ In regards to language, Manx Gaelic was the community language until the middle of the nineteenth century.⁴ The Manx Language Society had been founded in 1899, with the aim of preserving and reviving the Manx language, but by this date, the speakers of the language were elderly, and with little generational transmission of the language.⁵ The initial problem was that they had little idea as to how many speakers of the language remained alive. The 1901 census contained a language question, as per the request of the Society, and the resulting official publication of the figures in 1903 showed that 4,598 or 8.4% of the Island's population claimed competency to some degree in the language.⁶ As Sophia Morrison, the Secretary of the Society reported in 1904, 'the further one seeks, the more does one find that the number of people who are able to speak Manx is much greater than is generally supposed'.⁷

'An inanimate member of this Society'

The Society was to purchase an Edison phonograph in 1904, 'an inanimate member of this Society' as it was put in 1906⁸, and there is a remarkable amount of source material to

³ For background, see John Belchem, 'The Little Manx Nation: Antiquarianism, Ethnic Identity, and Home Rule Politics in the Isle of Man, 1880–1918', *Journal of British Studies* 39, no. 2 (2000).

⁴ George Broderick, *Language Death in the Isle of Man* (Niemeyer, 1999). Edward 'Ned' Maddrell, the last reputed native speaker died only in 1974.

⁵ Discussed in Stephen Miller, 'Here the Manx language lingers and may linger some time longer': Manx and English in Cregneash in 1901', *Zeitschrift für celtische Philologie* 55, no. 1 (2007): 108–21.

⁶ Table 18, 'Language Spoken', H.M. Government, *Census—1901: Islands in the British Seas*, Cd. 1473 (London: HMSO, 1903) 18. The number that is often quoted is that of 4,419 and thereby 8.1% of the population — this was the figure obtained by A.W. Moore from the Captains of Parishes responsible for gathering the Census Enumerators' Books together. It was put into circulation by Sophia Morrison when reporting to the annual meeting of the Society in 1901; evidently, when the books made it to London, the resulting official figure was higher, with an extra 79 speakers added on. Anon, 'Manx Language Society: Annual Meeting', *Manx Sun* 14 December, 1901, 3c–e.

⁷ Sophia Morrison, 'The Secretary's Report', *Annual Report. Hollantide, 1904* (Yn Cheshaght Ghailckagh, 1904), 4.

⁸ Morrison, Sophia. 'Secretary's Report'. *Annual Meeting of the Manx Language Society, held in the Librarian's Room, Public Library, Douglas, on Thursday, November 22, 1906*. n.p.: Manx Language Society, 1906: 4–7

allow for an in-depth and admittedly chronological account of the activities of this new member of the Society. Amongst the topics to be touched on here are the attitudes of the Victorian and Edwardian-era folk song collectors on the use (or not as they thought) of the phonograph, the discussion by the Society as to its purchase, and the detailed planning for collecting Island-wide. Then there is the key figure here of Sophia Morrison, the pan-Celtic enthusiast *par excellence*, present throughout the period of the use of the phonograph (1904–13). Interest from outside the Island is seen by Rudolf Trebitsch visiting twice on behalf of the Vienna Phonogrammarchiv, and then there is the involvement of the fringe figure of Gustav Burchardi. Whilst the Society sought to collect representative items of Manx Gaelic expressive culture, the nineteenth-century Methodist Revivals led to cultural erosion and a resistance as to what should be collected. The cylinders are now in large part lost but not before there was discussion about having copies made using the Galvano process. Despite the extant lengthy documentation, there are still a number of open questions about the Society's phonograph. Nevertheless, the Manx Language Society can be seen as a pioneer in the early adoption of the phonograph to document a Celtic language now passing into memory.

'Next time I come over I will 'fetch a compass''

The Gill brothers, W.H. Gill (1839–1923) and Deemster John Frederick Gill (1842–99), were active in collecting folk songs in the Isle of Man in 1896, and in the following year W.H. Gill wrote to his brother that:

This is a serious question considering the enormous difficulty (if not impossibility) of getting an absolutely true first record. Next time I come over I will 'fetch a compass'.

In other words I will bring a Phonograph. But even then the thing would have to be

translated into black & white and different translators would translate differently. So
we don't know where we are!⁹

And on this topic, again by W.H. Gill, in 1898,

And yet, if the tunes could be written down, as with a phonograph, exactly as we
heard them, and then reproduced faithfully, with all their vagueness of tempo, their
uncertainty of intonation, their little quaverings and embellishments, quite
unrepresentable by ordinary musical notation, if we had all these things faithfully
registered, who would care for the result?¹⁰

Béla Vikár (1859–1945) is credited as the first person in Europe to record folk songs
with the phonograph in 1892,¹¹ and by 1900 had assembled 500 cylinders, a number of which
were later on display at the Paris Exposition that year.¹² Vikár intended on lecturing to the
International Folklore Congress also held in Paris that year, but his lecture, 'Phonographic
collection of Hungarian folk-songs', was delivered in his absence by Paul Sébillot.¹³ A

⁹ Letter from W.H. Gill to Deemster J.F. Gill, 27 July 1897, Manx National Heritage Library (hereafter MNHL), MS 09702, Box 2.

¹⁰ W.H. Gill, 'Manx Music: A Sketch', *Manx National Music: Selected from the MS. Collection of the Deemster J.F. Gill, Dr J. Clague, and W.H. Gill, and Arranged by W.H. Gill* (London: Boosey, 1898), ix a.

¹¹ See fn. 8 in Walter Graf, 'The Phonogrammarchiv der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften in Vienna', *The Folklore and Folk Music Archivist* 4, no. 4 (1962): [4]. To settle the issue, the answer might lie for someone with Hungarian in Attila Terbócs, *Vikár Béla-bibliográfia*, Budapesti Finnugor Füzetek, vol. 13 (Budapest: ELTE Finnugor Tanszék, 1999). For a background to the early of the phonograph in ethnography, see Erika Brady, *A Spiral Way: How the Phonograph Changed Ethnography* (University Press of Mississippi, 1999).

¹² Exposition Internationale Universelle de 1900, '[Groupe III. Classe 17. Instruments de Musique. Pays Étrangers] Hongrie', *Catalogue Général Officiel. Groupe III. Instruments et procédés généraux des lettres, des sciences et des arts. Classes 11 à 18*, vol. 3 (Paris & Lille: Imprimeries Lemercier & L. Danel, 1900) 41, Commissariat Royal Hongrois, '[Groupe III. Instruments et procédés généraux des lettres, des sciences et des arts] Classe 17. Instruments de musique', *Exposition Universelle de 1900 à Paris. Catalogue Spécial. Exposition des Pays de la Couronne Hongrois* (Budapest: Commissariat Royal Hongrois, 1900), 348b.

¹³ Anon, 'Phonographic Records of Folk-Songs', *Journal of American Folklore* 14, no. 55 (1901): 313.

number of his cylinders were played in the previous talk given by one 'Dr Azoulay', who spoke on 'The Phonography of tales and songs'. John Abercromby, the Scottish folklorist who was in attendance, commented that '[t]hough the phonograph is not a very cheerful instrument to list to, Dr Azoulay made the most of it', and at the end he was 'loudly applauded'.¹⁴ Incidentally, Abercromby mentioned that he had visited Vikár the previous summer and had listened to a number of his recordings.

For those without a phonograph, or the ability to notate music, the English folk song collector Lucy Broadwood suggested that same year of 1892, that '[i]n cases where the collector has no knowledge of music, a local organist or schoolmaster can usually be found to note down the simple air'.¹⁵ Even those who could 'note down' were to find it a difficult task as Vic Gammon has commented:

There can be no doubt that taking down songs by the pencil and paper method was an arduous business. It required the complete attention of the collector and the complete co-operation of the singer. It sometimes also required some sort of transaction between the collector and singer. It was best done by two collectors working together, one to take down the words, the other the tunes. Collectors usually preferred working in pairs but this was not always practical. The result of solo collecting was that songs were often incomplete, usually tunes were collected without full words but sometimes the reverse occurred.¹⁶

¹⁴ John Abercromby, 'The International Congress of Folklore in Paris', *Folk-lore* xi, no. 4 (1900): 428.

¹⁵ Lucy E. Broadwood, 'Folk-Songs and Music', *Folk-lore* iii, no. 4 (1892): 552.

¹⁶ Vic Gammon, 'Folk Song Collecting in Sussex and Surrey, 1843–1914', *History Workshop Journal* 10 (1980): 64.

This was certainly the case with the Gill brothers and Clague whose collections consist of tunes only.

P.W. Caine (1887–1956), another Manx song collector, conveyed the difficulty of notating in the field, writing in a letter in 1914 that '[t]aking down music in the Dorian mode is not so easy as it looks, & one is apt to lose the key, especially when the singer'.¹⁷ This placed a limit on the amount of material that could be comfortably gathered when out collecting. Three tunes per session seems to have been the norm for Dr John Clague (1842–1908), who collected in the south of the Island and collaborated with the Gills:

An old blind man — Tom Kermode by name, has given me three splendid old songs, and I think I shall be able to get three more yet. I have had three from old Fargher who gave me 'Shannon Rea', and he has another which I shall probably get this week.¹⁸

The phonograph, at first, appeared to be able to remove these restraints with the literal drop of a needle. In 1907, Charles Myers, in the appendix to 'The Ethnological Study of Music', described the kit and accessories that comprised the Edison Standard phonograph and spelt out in detail as to how the phonograph was to be used in the field for recording music.¹⁹ If anything, however, recording with the phonograph was to be less 'spontaneous' than collecting with pen and pencil and more difficult to organise. For example, a rehearsal was

¹⁷ Letter from P.W. Caine to Sophia Morrison, 24 February 1914, MNHL, MS 09495, Box 1.

¹⁸ Letter from Dr John Clague to Deemster J.F. Gill, 25 December 1895, MNHL, MS 09702, Box 2.

¹⁹ Charles S. Myers, 'The Ethnological Study of Music', in *Anthropological Essays presented to Edward Burnett Tylor*, ed. Northcote W. Thomas (Clarendon Press, 1907).

advisable, thought Myers before recording began, and the quality of a session varied from singer to singer because of their individual voice quality:

Individual voices will be found to differ considerably in the successfulness of the records which they yield. A powerful voice will often yield a most unpleasantly sounding phonogram. This is particularly apt to occur if the singer be not placed so as to sing directly into the centre of the trumpet. If he be sitting sideways near the instrument, so that his voice falls obliquely on to the trumpet, a very jarring and unfaithful record will result.²⁰

Equally jarring was the advice that '[t]he title of the song should be sung into the phonograph before the record is taken. This is to be followed by the sounding of the pitch-pipe, which should serve as a signal for the musicians to begin'.²¹

Another physical constraint was the running time of the cylinder itself, varying between two or three and a half minutes long, making the recording of any but the shortest pieces a difficult task. Eugénie Lineff (Evgenija Lineva) (1854–1919), when collecting amongst the Doukhobors, a Russian-speaking Pacificist sect resettled in the Caucasus, mentioned that '[a]s just stated, the Doochobor psalms are exceedingly long, one verse along taking not less than two to three cylinders for recording'.²² Her solution was a simple one:

²⁰ Myers, 'The Ethnological Study of Music', 252.

²¹ Myers, 'The Ethnological Study of Music', 252.

²² Eugénie Lineff, 'Psalms and Religious Songs of Russian Sectarians in the Caucasus', *Report of the Fourth Congress of the International Musical Society, London, 29th May—3rd June, 1911* (Novello and Company, 1912) 196.

'The psalms were so long that several cylinders were required to record one psalm, so I had to get another phonograph to do the recording without interruption'.²³

Returning to the decidedly less mountainous Isle of Man, W.H. Gill could and did take down tunes in staff notation, but his objection to the phonograph prefigured the discussion amongst members of the Folk-Song Society after Percy Grainger's 'Collecting with the Phonograph' appeared in the *Journal of the Folk Song Society* in 1908.²⁴ Whilst Gill was not prepared to use the phonograph, George Gilmore of the National Telephone Company in the Island was willing to do so, and at a talk on 25 February 1899,

In conclusion he exhibited his capital little phonograph, which rendered popular music and a speech of President Lincoln's. One of the pieces given created no small amount of amusement. It was the 'Hunt the wren' song accompanied by vigorous horn blowing. This item, Mr Gilmore explained, was captured by him at his front door on St Stephen's Day, and it was a remarkably good capture too.²⁵

The 26 December was the occasion for 'Hunt the Wren', a calendar custom where groups of young males went house visiting in the morning until noon, parading a 'wren bush', a pole elaborately decked out in foliage displaying a wren killed that morning, and singing a song to collect money from the household. Those who gave received a feather from the bird

²³ Lineff, 'Psalms and Religious Songs of Russian Sectarrians in the Caucasus', 196.

²⁴ Percy Grainger, 'Collecting with the Phonograph', *Journal of the Folk Song Society* iii, no. 12 (1908). See Michael Yates, 'Percy Grainger and the Impact of the Phonograph', *Folk Music Journal* 4, no. 3 (1982). Further, C.J. Bearman, 'Percy Grainger, the Phonograph, and the Folk Song Society', *Music & Letters* 84, no. 3 (2003), Alan Gibbs and C.J. Bearman, 'Percy Grainger and the Phonograph', *Music & Letters* 85, no. 3 (2004).

²⁵ Anon, '[Douglas] A Talk about Electricity', *Isle of Man Examiner* 25 February, 1899, 6b.

to ensure good luck for the coming year. This recording is now lost but stands to date as the first collecting known by phonograph of Manx folk song.

That same year, at the Wesleyan Bazaar in Peel held in April 1899, '[a]dditional interest was given to this entertainment on Monday by the introduction of Mr Jos. Wood's graphophone, when during other novelties the audience were regaled by 'Mylecharaine' as sung by Mr T. Crellin'.²⁶ The following month, E.E. Fournier, the Irish pan-Celtic enthusiast, wrote to the Manx bibliophile, G.W. Wood, that 'I am sending you one of my records — Mr Radcliffe's recitation of the Ten Commandments, made from 'Yn Chied Lioar Gailckagh', p. 9', adding that 'I hope the record will arrive safely'.²⁷ Fournier commented that '[t]hese records cannot be replaced, as they can only be reproduced with considerable loss of loudness', and ended his letter: 'Wishing you every success in your efforts to acquire a speaking Knowledge of your national language' (i.e. Manx Gaelic).

The phonograph had earlier been deployed in the pan-Celtic cause, this time in Ireland, when at the *Feis Ceoil* ('Festival of Music') held in Belfast in May 1897, 'Saturday's doings [...] ranged from 'the recording of unpublished Irish airs in the phonograph' to a 'country fiddlers' competition'.²⁸ The Welsh Folk Song Society founded in 1906, was gifted a phonograph in 1909, and the following year, one of its members, Ruth Herbert Lewis (1871–1946), who had joined the Society in 1908, purchased her own phonograph in 1910, and made use of it later that year.²⁹ The outcome of her collecting was to be *Folk-Songs Collected*

²⁶ Anon, 'Wesleyan Bazaar', *Peel City Guardian* 8 April, 1899, 2e.

²⁷ Letter from E.E. Fournier to G.W. Wood, 9 May 1899, found tipped into 'Manx Language Society 1899: 1931', MNHL, L3 1/1. I am grateful to Alan Franklin, past Deputy Librarian of the MNHL, for bring this letter to my attention. Radcliffe was reading from a learning primer, Joseph Cain and William Kneen, *Yn Chied Lioar Gailckagh* (Douglas: n.pub, 1898).

²⁸ Pseud [signed as 'By Our Special Correspondent'], 'The *Feis Ceoil* at Belfast', *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular* 39, no. 664 (1898): 391b.

²⁹ E. Wyn James, 'An 'English' lady among the Welsh folk: Ruth Herbert Lewis and the Welsh Folk-Song Society', *Folk Song: Tradition, Revival, and Re-Creation*, eds. Ian Russell and David Atkinson (The Elphinstone Institute, University of Aberdeen, 2004), David R. Jones, 'Lady Ruth Herbert Lewis (1871 — 1946): Indefatigable Collector of Flintshire's Folk-Songs', *Flintshire Historical Society Journal* 37 (2007): 125-6.

in Flintshire and the Vale of Clwyd (1914). Incidentally, she was of Manx descent, and at the Fourth Celtic Congress held in Douglas in the Isle of Man in July 1921, gave a talk on 'Welsh and Manx Folk Songs'.³⁰

Turning to Scotland, songs in Gaelic were first collected in Lewis and Wester Ross in 1908, by Dr MacRae for Lucy Broadwood.³¹

George Gilmore's 'capture' of Wren Boys singing 'Hunt the Wren' in 1898, was accidental, whereas Joseph Wood's recording of 'Mylecharaine' by Thomas Crellin, and Fournier's engagement with William Radcliffe, the head teacher of Andreas Parochial School in the following year, reflected the growing interest in what was termed at the time as the Manx Revival. It was to fall to the Manx Language Society to initiate systematic collecting with the phonograph, and those words of Manx soon to be lost to now be saved in the grooves of the wax cylinder. The key figure here was to be Sophia Morrison, the Secretary of the Society.

'At the wheel': Sophia Morrison

'If we had not Miss Morrison at the wheel, I am afraid our ship would have foundered long ago. I only hope that she may be long spared to carry on her labour of love',³² wrote J.J. Kneen, a Manx language enthusiast to William Cubbon, the proprietor of the *Manx Sun* newspaper in 1915. Sophia Morrison (1859–1917) was the pan-Celtic enthusiast *par excellence*, and one as well with private means to support her endeavours. Besides being the Secretary of the Manx Language Society, she was a folklore and folk song collector, as well

³⁰ Ruth Herbert Lewis, 'Welsh and Manx Folk Songs', in *Transactions of the Celtic Congress, 1921*, ed. D. Rhys Phillips (Swansea: 1923).

³¹ Ethel Bassin, 'Lucy Broadwood 1858–1929: Her Contribution to the Collection and Study of Gaelic Traditional Song', *Scottish Studies* 9 (1965): 146.

³² Letter from J.J. Kneen to William Cubbon, 9 November 1915, MNHL, MS 09913, Box 'WC: Correspondence'.

as the founder and editor of *Mannin*, a small press magazine, the organiser of a number of Manx Concerts on Old Christmas Day in Peel. She was also a member of the Peel Players, a troupe who performed plays in Manx English. With Ottie Joughin she had been one of the figures behind the Peel Manx Language Association in running language classes in their home town. It is no great surprise in that case that she was to play a key role in regards to the phonograph and the Manx Language Society.

Peel, her hometown, lay on the west coast of the Island, but by the opening of the twentieth century, its fishing days were over due to the collapse of the spring Irish mackerel fishing. The early 1900s saw numerous newspaper adverts for the sale of fishing boats; the *Honey Bee*, for example, was sold in 1902, for just £300, having cost over £1,000 to build (and its new owners were Irish).³³ In 1900, boats were on offer 'belonging to the bankrupt estates of Messrs William Moore and Thomas Clague'.³⁴ Charles Morrison, the father of Sophia, had made his money provisioning fishing boats and purchasing shares in them, but had exited in good time and invested in property, subsequently allowing his children to live off the proceeds.

Hand-in-hand with economic decline was cultural revival. 'Peel is now looked upon as the seat of the Manx language revival, and it well merits the distinction', reported the *Peel City Guardian* in 1900, adding that '[a] number of Manx people think fit to belittle the revival, and we would advise those people to visit the class on a Wednesday evening and see the hard working students young and old — but a preponderance of young — and the patient and enthusiastic teachers at work'. In 1902, the Peel Clothworkers School took a 'a census of the parents as to whether they were agreed that the children should be taught Manx lessons'.³⁵

³³ Anon, 'Sale of Peel Boats', *Peel City Guardian* 27 September, 1902, [3]c.

³⁴ Anon, 'Sale of Peel Fishing Boats', *Peel City Guardian* 7 July, 1900, [2]g.

³⁵ Anon, 'The Manx Language in Peel', *Peel City Guardian*, 27 September, 1902, [2]g.

With a majority of twenty-three, it was to go forward, and '[t]he lessons will be provided by the Manx Language Society, of which Miss Morrison is the hon. secretary'. (This seems never to have happened.)

'A new ally has come to the cause'

'A new ally has come to the cause in the form of an Edison Phonograph, whose function it is to preserve the Manx sounds as uttered by native speakers'.³⁶ So reported Sophia Morrison, Secretary of the Manx Language Society, in her annual report for 1905. The balance sheet outlined the expenditure on this new found ally: £7 15s. 0d. on the phonograph itself, complete with an extra horn, stand, and basket, £1 16s. 0d. on blank records, and the sum of 12/- for repairs to the phonograph itself, perhaps damaged in transit to the Island.³⁷ The idea of purchasing a phonograph was first mentioned at the November 1902 annual meeting of the Society:

Mr Taylor asked why the Society did not collected [*sic*] Oral Gaelic literature, and suggested that some of the balance in hand [£7 12s. 3d.] should be applied for the purpose.

The Chairman [Rev. Canon Savage] said it was an important question, and the members, especially those in the country, should preserve all distinctly Manx proverbs, stories, and traditions that had come down to them.

³⁶ Sophia Morrison, 'The Secretary's Report', *Annual Meeting, 1905* (Manx Language Society, 1905), 4.

³⁷ Manx Language Society, 'Balance Sheet from Hollantide 1904, to Hollantide, 1905', *Annual Meeting, 1905* (Manx Language Society, 1905).

Mr Taylor suggested that a phonograph should be purchased for the purpose of recording the best Manx speakers.

The Chairman was afraid the balance would not allow it, but he was aware that such things had been recorded in this way.³⁸

It is possible that John Taylor, the Douglas Borough Librarian, drew his inspiration from an article by Edward Dodgson that had appeared in the *Manx Church Magazine* in 1901:

It is to be hoped that a phonograph will be provided onto which the best Gaelic speakers in the Island, such as Mr Cashen, shall be invited to read off the whole of one or two of the older books in the language, the paraphrase-epitome of *Paradise Lost*, for instance. By this means, future generations would have the means of knowing how the words were sounded at the beginning of the twentieth century.³⁹

However, the financial situation of the Society was soon to change; William Cubbon wrote to Morrison in November of 1903, 'I send you a rough draft of Bal[ance] Sheet. There is a nice sum in hand—thanks to your unaided efforts. How w[oul]d it do to purchase a phonograph to secure records of speech?'⁴⁰ He wrote again the next year in March 1904, 'I have been enquiring from a musician of note in Douglas, & he is of the opinion that the

³⁸ Anon, 'Manx Language Society', *Isle of Man Examiner*, 15 November, 1902, 5c–d. This passage does not appear in Manx Language Society, *Annual Meeting November 12, 1902* (n.pub. [but Manx Language Society], 1902), which first appeared as Anon, 'The Manx Language Society', *Manx Sun*, 15 November, 1902, 6d–f.

³⁹ E.S. Dodgson, 'Some Inscriptions in the Gaelic of Mann', *Manx Church Magazine* xi.10 (1901): cxxx a.

⁴⁰ Letter from William Cubbon to Sophia Morrison, 24 November 1903, MNHL, MS 09495, Sophia Morrison Papers, Box 1.

Columbia Co's phonograph @ 6 guineas would be the best for securing records for our purposes', adding, '[h]e has gone through all the catalogues'.⁴¹ He asked that she speak to the Society's president and executive committee and see if they would be agreeable to such a purchase. 'We have over £12 in hand, & I am anxious that we should do something with it'.

Morrison canvassed the opinion of Dr John Clague, whose response was negative, as his letter from April 1904 shows, '[p]ersonally, I do not think much of the idea of the phonograph'.⁴² Regardless, at the Hollantide 1904 annual meeting, it was 'moved that a gramophone, with cylinder records, be obtained, for use by the Society, in order that the accent and pronunciation of the words in the Manx should be fully preserved for future generations'.⁴³ Seconded by John Nelson, and adopted unanimously, the Society decided to set up the inevitable committee 'to obtain the instrument' as it was so-called.⁴⁴

As well as the creation of this *ad-hoc* purchasing committee, preparations were made for the collecting campaign to come. The Island was divided into four districts, North, West, South, and Douglas (to cover the east of the Island from the capital). A pair (or trio) of collectors was then appointed to each part: Miss Emily Gill and John Nelson (North); Morrison herself, Mr Cashen, and Mr Teare (West); the Rev. C.H. Leece, William Kneen, and Thomas Moore (South); and the Chairman of the Society [Dr John Clague], the Treasurer [William Cubbon], Mr Taylor, and Mr W. Quayle (Douglas).

Morrison's form letter to Emily Gill survives in her letter copy book:

⁴¹ Letter from William Cubbon to Sophia Morrison, 29 March 1904, MNHL, MS 09495, Sophia Morrison Papers, Box 1.

⁴² Letter from Dr John Clague to Sophia Morrison, 10 April 1904, MNHL, MS 09495, Sophia Morrison Papers, Box 3.

⁴³ Manx Language Society, 'Recording Manx Speakers and Singers', *Annual Report. Hollantide, 1904* (Manx Language Society, 1904).

⁴⁴ Nevertheless, the committee moved with speed, unlike *The Committee for the Collection of Slovenian Folk Songs* (OSNP). Founded in 1905, and with the intention to purchase a phonograph from the start, it took until 1913 that the decision was eventually made and 1914 for it to turn up. See, Drago Kunej, 'We have plenty of words written down; We need melodies!': The Purchase of the First Recording Device for Ethnomusicological Research in Slovenia', *Traditiones* 34, no. 1 (2005).

Nov. 26. 04

Dear Madam,

As you are (perhaps) aware it was decided at the Annual Meeting of the M. L[.] S[.] to purchase a Phonogram with the object of storing up Manx records in various parts of the Island.

I have been requested to inform you that you were one of those nominated to take charge of the records at one centre. May I ask if you will kindly consent to act (with Mr) & secure such records of Manx speech & song as you are able in your neighbourhood[.]

It was thought well to bracket together for the work persons of education & musical ability with others, who, though full of zeal for the cause have not those advantages[.]

Yrs etc S.M. | Miss Emily Gill ⁴⁵

Emily M. Gill, whether truly 'full of zeal for the cause' or not, was twenty-nine years old at the time of the 1901 census, the unmarried daughter of Hugh Stowell Gill, the Archdeacon of Sodor and Man, and living in the rectory at Andreas.⁴⁶ In regards to the answer to the language question in the census, only her father and Elizabeth Watterson, the cook to the household (aged also twenty-nine) were returned as Manx speakers, the other eight members and the one visitor to the Rectory all spoke English only.

However, the Society had yet to purchase a phonogram, but they were soon to be offered one by a Mr Quayle who had read of the meeting in the *Manx Sun*. He was the

⁴⁵ Letter from Sophia Morrison to Emily Gill, 26 November 1904, MNHL, MS 09495, Sophia Morrison Papers, Box 4, Disbound Letter Copy Book (1904–07).

⁴⁶ *Census Enumerators' Book* for Andreas 1901, TNA, RG 13/5300, fol. 132, sch. 3.

manager of the Port St Mary branch of S.K. Broadbent (the publisher of the *Isle of Man Examiner*) where they had a phonograph for sale as J.J. Kneen to Morrison reported in December 1904, when 'it was listed at 8 guineas [without records], and they are willing to let it go at £4 . 15 with 17 records'.⁴⁷ He continued that 'I believe it is almost new, having been taken by them from a firm across the water in liquidation of a debt. If suitable, it w[oul]d be a cheap lot, but of course I do not understand much about them'. Kneen acknowledged himself ignorant as to its suitability as did Morrison who had also been individually contacted with the offer of its sale.⁴⁸ Seeking advice, she was told that the Society needed a model with an Edison horn in order to make records. Her letter ended with a mention that the Phonograph Committee was to meet the next week, and she hoped that Kneen would attend it. Morrison did write to decline the offer.⁴⁹

The committee, when meeting on 11 December, was close to settling on the purchase, however, of a Pathé Frères 'Perfecta', it being 'the least nasal of all the various makes on the market, & the most highly recommended', as Morrison informed Kneen.⁵⁰ She had seen this particular model, along with other makes, when in London visiting a friend, likely the person who had advised against taking up Quayle's offer:

A London friend has one which he shewed me whilst I was in London, he had

three other makes before this one—Columbia, etc, but he thinks the Pathé Frères

⁴⁷ Letter from J.J. Kneen to Sophia Morrison, 5 December 1904, MNHL, MS 09495, Sophia Morrison Papers, Box 3.

⁴⁸ Letter from Sophia Morrison to J.J. Kneen, 8 December 1904, MNHL, MS 1086/6 C.

⁴⁹ Morrison did write to decline the offer. Copy letter from Sophia Morrison addressed to the *Isle of Man Examiner* from Sophia Morrison, undated [but December 1904], MNHL, MS 09495, Sophia Morrison Papers, Box 4, Disbound Letter Copy Book (1904–07).

⁵⁰ Letter from Sophia Morrison to J.J. Kneen, 11 December 1904, MNHL, MS 1086/7 C. Seemingly Kneen did not attend the meeting, and so the letter to inform him of the decision taken by the Society.

the best. He is an expert, & has plenty of money to indulge in hobbies of this kind —money is no object with him so long as he gets the best thing in the market'.⁵¹

In the end, what was purchased was an Edison phonograph and it was on the Island in February 1905, as the Society was looking to keep it safe between trips in the Town Hall in Douglas.⁵² The Executive Meeting of the Society for 4 February 1905, discussed the new purchase at length:

II. Re new Phonograph it was resolved: —

- (a) That the Society's new phonograph should be sent round the Island in the following order — Peel, Rushen, Ramsey and Douglas, & that 12 blank records should be allotted to each district.
- (b) That in no case must those in charge of the Phonograph in each of the districts keep it longer than four weeks, unless written permission to do so be obtained either from the President or the Secretary.
- (c) That the Phonograph must not be loaned out to any entertainment, or for any purpose whatever, without a charge. The charge to be one shilling for each record if less than six be taken—if more than six be taken—then for those over six, a charge of 6^d each.

⁵¹ Letter from Sophia Morrison to J.J. Kneen, 11 December 1904, MNHL, MS 1086/7 C.

⁵² Copy letter from Sophia Morrison to John Taylor, undated [February 1905], MNHL, MS 09495, Sophia Morrison Papers, Box 4, Disbound Letter Copy Book (1904–07).

(d) That permission to store up the records in the Town Hall, Douglas, be written for to the authorities.⁵³

The First Recording Session (12 April 1905): 'The results are most interesting'

The Manx Language Society set to work at once, the first report of the new ally appearing in the *Peel City Guardian* issue for 15 April 1905, the piece here given in full:

The Manx Language Society has decided to obtain gramophone records of the Manx language, as spoken by residents in various parts of the Island familiar with it, and for the purpose of procuring such records from people in the South, Mr R.A. Shortland and C.T. Cowell, jun[io]r, went to Port Erin on Wednesday. A slight readjustment in the mechanism of the machine suggested itself to one of the young men, and an improvement was effected, with the result that some splendid specimens of Manx were recorded. Those who spoke in the gramophone were Mr and Mrs Moore, Mr Keggen (who is 84 years of age), and Mr Kneen; and the selections recited were the most part Biblical passages. A few hymns and verses of well-known songs were also sung. The results are most interesting.⁵⁴

A fuller account appeared the same day this time in the *Isle of Man Times* and gives more names than in the piece above as well.⁵⁵

⁵³ Minutes of the Executive Meeting of the Manx Language Society, 4 February 1905, Manx Language Society Minute Book (1899–1913), Thie ny Gaelgey, Yn Çeshaght Ghailckagh archive. This was carried through to the Committee Meeting of 18 February 1905: 'Business I—To lay before the meeting the decisions of the Executive re Cregeen's Dictionary & the Phonograph'. No discussion followed on this latter issue. Minutes of the Committee Meeting of the Manx Language Society, 18 February 1905, Manx Language Society Minute Book (1899–1913), Thie ny Gaelgey, Yn Çeshaght Ghailckagh archive.

⁵⁴ Anon, 'Gramophone Manx Records', *Peel City Guardian*, 15 April, 1905, 8b.

⁵⁵ Anon, 'The Manx Language and the Phonograph', *Isle of Man Times*, 15 April, 1905, 7g.

The phonograph had already been in action in Peel, first used by Sophia Morrison, 'who has secured a grand collection'. This time the phonograph was at 'Brookfield', the 'cosy home' in Port Erin as the paper put it, of the Moores. Thomas Moore, aged sixty-eight in the 1901 census, was a retired farmer living at Ballafesson with his wife Annie, aged sixty-three.⁵⁶

Present, too, were J.J. Kneen, mentioned earlier, the Rev. C.H. Leece, the Vicar of Rushen, Frederick Caparn (described as 'a gentleman, an engineer, and most valuable helper'), Richard Lace, the schoolmaster at Santan, and others unnamed. Ramsey A. Shortland was sixteen, a stationer's assistant, living at home with his family at 22 Berkeley Street in Douglas.⁵⁷ Charles T. Cowell was aged thirteen at the time of the 1901 census and living at home with his family at 4 Victoria Road in Douglas.⁵⁸ While Cowell was Manx-born, the Shortland family were all born in England. All households were English-speaking ones. Cowell's father was a watchmaker and jeweller, and one wonders if the son was then the one able to make the 'slight readjustment' mentioned to the phonograph.

Besides the Moores, those others recorded were Edward Faragher, a fisherman of Cregneash, aged seventy, a widower;⁵⁹ William Keggen, farming at Glendown seventy-nine years old, his wife Ann, sixty-seven;⁶⁰ William Kneen a retired farmer, aged seventy-four, residing at Croit-e-Caley with his wife, Elizabeth, who was eight-three;⁶¹ John Sansbury a

⁵⁶ *Census Enumerators' Book* for Rushen 1901, TNA, RG 13/5301, fol. 122, sch. 100.

⁵⁷ *Census Enumerators' Book* for Douglas 1901, TNA, RG 13/5304, fol. 73, sch. 17.

⁵⁸ *Census Enumerators' Book* for Douglas 1901, TNA, RG 13/5304, fol. 107, sch. 18.

⁵⁹ *Census Enumerators' Book* for Rushen 1901, TNA, RG 13/5301, fol. 108, sch. 145. Edward Faragher (1831–1908); further, see George Broderick, 'Manx Stories and Reminiscences of Ned Beg Hom Ruy', *Zeitschrift für celtische Philologie* 38 (1981): 113–78; George Broderick, 'Manx Stories and Reminiscences of Ned Beg Hom Ruy: Translation and Notes', *Zeitschrift für celtische Philologie* 39 (1982): 117–94.

⁶⁰ *Census Enumerators' Book* for Rushen 1901, TNA, RG 13/5301, fol. 106, sch. 114.

⁶¹ *Census Enumerators' Book* for Rushen 1901, TNA, RG 13/5301, fol. 135, sch. 87.

farmer aged eight-six, living at Surby with Anne, his wife who was eighty-one.⁶² All resided in the parish of Rushen.

The Annual Meeting of the Manx Language Society (1905)

According to Morrison's report to the Society in 1905, the phonograph had been used in the south and the west of the Island and '[t]he instrument is to go to Laxey and Ramsey within the next few weeks, and then come back to Douglas again'.⁶³ After the end of the formal business of the meeting, a number of the recordings were played aloud to the meeting and '[a]mong the records put through were the following':

By Mr Edward Cubbon, Peel, a song 'Neddy Hom Ruy'; by Mr W. Cashen, Peel, the Creed, the Lord's Prayer, Boxing the Compass; Mr Thos. Moore, Surby, Rushen, Corinthians, 13th Chapter, and song, the 'Wreck of the Herring Fleet'; Mr Jack Cregeen, Peel, song, 'Ec ny Fiddleryn' ('At the Fiddlers'); Peel boys trained by Miss Morrison, song, 'Hop-tu-naa'; Mr W. Kneen, Croit-e-Caley, Rushen, two hymns; Mr Wm. Cain, Glen Helen, 'Mylechraine', and 'Kirroo-fo Niaghtey' ('The Sheep under the Snow'); Mr John Quirk, Peel, an original yarn about the fishing; Mr Caesar Cashen, Peel, two hymns; and also some miscellaneous renderings by Mr W. Cashen, tailor, Peel; altogether a very excellent and creditable series.⁶⁴

⁶² *Census Enumerators' Book* for Rushen 1901, TNA, RG 13/5301, fol. 120, sch. 6. For an obituary notice, see Anon, '[Memorial Notices] John Sansbury. Died July 9th, 1908', *Manx Quarterly* 5 (1908).

⁶³ Manx Language Society, 'Records of the Manx Language', 8.

⁶⁴ Manx Language Society, 'Records of the Manx Language', 8.

A mix here of sung and spoken items, with both secular and religious material were taken down. Well-known folk songs were represented, such as 'Ec ny Fiddleryn' ('At the Fiddlers'), 'Kirroo-fo Niaghtey' ('The Sheep under the Snow'), 'Mylechraine' (a Manx family name), and the 'Wreck of the Herring Fleet'. Then there was 'Hop-tu-Naa', a song sung at Hollantide as part of a house-visiting custom. However, hitherto unrecorded is 'Neddy Hom Ruy', a song about Edward Faragher of Cregneash(?), the title here being his Manx patronymic. Material, such as Boxing the Compass and Quirk's reminiscence about fishing, spoke literally about the Island's fishing heritage. Hymns, a reciting of the Lord's Prayer, the Creed, and I Corinthians 13, a Biblical passage, saw to the spiritual side of matters.

As regards to those recorded, William Cain(e) was a gardener at Glen Helen, a waterfall attraction in the parish of German, living in at the hotel there.⁶⁵ Aged seventy, he was unmarried. He was also known as 'Willy-the-Fairy' as Morrison recounted: "Willy-the-Fairy", as he is called, who lives at Rhenass, says he often hears the fairies singing and playing up the Glen o' nights. I have heard him sing airs which he said he had thus learned from the 'Little People'.⁶⁶ Ceasar Cashin (as his surname is stated) was a greengrocer, aged forty-two, living at 1 Castle Street in Peel with his wife, Elizabeth, also forty-two, who spoke only English.⁶⁷ Edward Cubbon was a milk dealer, fifty-four, residing at 36 Douglas Street, Peel, with his wife and family.⁶⁸ Ann Cubbon was forty-eight, and spoke only English, as did their three children, aged from eight to nineteen. William Cashen, aged sixty-two, was the Custodian of Peel Castle, living with Susannah, his wife aged fifty-nine, and their twenty-

⁶⁵ *Census Enumerators' Book* for German 1901, TNA, RG 13/5306, fol. 69, sch. 13.

⁶⁶ Sophia Morrison, '[The Taking of Evidence, iv. In the Isle of Man] Introduction', *The Fairy Faith in Celtic Countries* (Oxford University Press, 1911) 118.

⁶⁷ *Census Enumerators' Book* for Peel 1901, TNA, RG 13/5306, fol. 8, sch. 53.

⁶⁸ *Census Enumerators' Book* for Peel 1901, TNA, RG 13/5306, fol. 32, sch. 86.

three-year-old son at 3 Marine Parade, Peel.⁶⁹ The only Manx speaker amongst this group was Cashen himself. While the second William Cashin (again as he is recorded) is described as a tailor, he is recorded in the 1901 census as a fisherman, aged then sixty-two, and living with his wife Ellen, fifty-six, at 3 Tynwald Road, Peel, both of them recorded as bilingual.⁷⁰ John ('Jack') Cregeen was a mariner, seventy-two, widowed and living with his daughter, Matilda, thirty-two, at 19 Stanley Road, Peel.⁷¹ She spoke only English. John Quirk, aged fifty-six, was a mariner and boarding house-keeper living at 'Tynwald House', 56 Marine Parade, Peel, with his wife, Honora, fifty-nine, and their four daughters.⁷² While their parents were bilingual, the siblings, ranging in age from sixteen to twenty-three, spoke only English.

Sophia Morrison and the Phonograph

In the 1905 report, Morrison narrates an encounter of her own with a singer and with the phonograph. Coaxed down from the roof of the barn he was repairing, he was persuaded to sing two songs:

His amazement was extreme when he heard the songs repeated by the phonogram. His face was a study of critical enjoyment. 'Well', he said with a sigh of content, 'I thought I was about the bes' that's going at the Manx but that fella bates me clane altogether'. In the middle of the song he had broken off to ask for a rest, and when he heard this request also repeated, he was a little annoyed. 'I'll

⁶⁹ *Census Enumerators' Book* for Peel 1901, TNA, RG 13/5306, fol. 7, sch. 48.

⁷⁰ *Census Enumerators' Book* for Peel 1901, TNA, RG 13/5306, fol. 22, sch. 267.

⁷¹ *Census Enumerators' Book* for Peel 1901, TNA, RG 13/5306, fol. 10, sch. 85.

⁷² *Census Enumerators' Book* for Peel 1901, TNA, RG 13/5306, fol. 8, sch. 53.

give in he is better at the Manx till me', he said, 'but he needn't mock me for all,
he might have lef' that out'.⁷³

This is easily identifiable as a formulaic 'rube' story, the reciter seemingly not understanding that it is his own voice that is being played back and heard. This is a regular feature of these descriptive accounts of early collecting with the phonograph and is featured in an account of the *Feis Ceoil* held in Belfast in 1897, mentioned earlier.⁷⁴

There is also another short account by Morrison of her collecting with the phonograph, this time in her own hand, unfortunately undated. Coming across a Manx emigrant who was returning on a visit from Arizona for the last time, she discovered he was the son of 'Tom Billy Hal' (Thomas Callister) to whom 'Arrane ny Ferrishyn Ghelbee', ('Song of the Dalby Fairies') was attributed:

I invited him to my house and asked him to sing some of his father's songs into the M. L. S. gramophone. He had only about 20 m[*inutes*] to spare but he kindly came with me and sang two songs into the horn, one being the 'Song of the Dalby fairies', the other the genuine Manx version of 'Hunt the Wren', of which Mr A.W. Moore writes that no one ever heard it in Manx until he turned the English version into Manx.⁷⁵

⁷³ Manx Language Society, 'Records of the Manx Language', 8.

⁷⁴ Joseph Bennett, 'Facts, Rumours, and Remarks', *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular* 39, no. 661 (1898): 169a.

⁷⁵ Sophia Morrison, 'Manx Fragments of Music', MNHL, MS 09495, Sophia Morrison Papers, Box 7.

The manuscript is incomplete but not before mentioning that Callister was nervous at the idea of being recorded. While this was a feature overall of collecting, the physical presence of the phonograph exacerbated the anxiety of the singer or informant. John Nelson had a similar experience when recording, in this case recited material, and when sending a box of cylinders to William Cubbon, wrote in his letter that 'there are a few little Stammers [sic] & repetition here & there which is very hard to avoid as you have to Keep [sic] going like a water wheel when you once start'.⁷⁶

The Widda Man (1907)

The collecting activities of the Society with the phonograph even made it, remarkable though it sounds, into the pages of a novel set in the Island, namely Thomas Kingston Clarke's *The Widda-Man* (1907). The relevant passage is found in chapter eight, *The Visit to the Calf*:

Ay, the Manx language is dying out fast. You know John Sanbury [sic], at Surby?

'I am proud of his acquaintance'.

Well, only yesterday I was hearing that a party of scholarly folk had been up there with a phonograph, for the grand old man to speak into it; and amongst other things he repeated the 'Lord's Prayer', and sang 'Rock of Ages', so that the natural tones and inflections of a Maxman using his mother-tongue should be preserved for generation yet unborn.⁷⁷

⁷⁶ Letter from John Nelson to William Cubbon, 28 November 1906, MNHL, MS 5606 A.

⁷⁷ T. Kingston Clarke, *The 'Widda-Man'* (Archibald Constable, 1907) 289. By Calf is meant the Calf of Man, a small islet off the southern coast of the Island.

Sansbury was indeed present at the 1905 recording session at 'Brookfield', and it is possible that Clarke, too, was there at the time.

Rudolf Trebitsch: 'A well-known savant'

The *Isle of Man Weekly Times* in its issue of 7 September 1907, reported that:

Dr Adolf [*sic*] Trebitsch, of Vienna, has been deputed by the Austrian Imperial Academy of Sciences to proceed to Scotland, Ireland, Wales, and Man to study the Celtic languages, and make comparisons. The doctor, who is a well-known savant, arrived in Douglas yesterday (Friday). He is anxious to take phonographic records in the Manx, and those of our readers who would like to contribute should communicate with Mr W. Cubbon, 'Times' Office Branch, Victoria-street, who would make the necessary arrangements.⁷⁸

This is Rudolf Trebitsch (1876–1918), a wealthy ethnologist who worked in close cooperation with the Phonogrammarchiv in both Vienna and Berlin (established in 1899 and 1900, respectively).⁷⁹ Able to finance his own travel and research, he visited first Greenland in 1906, and then from 1907–9 travelled widely in Ireland, Wales, Brittany, the Isle of Man,

⁷⁸ Anon, 'Dr Adolf [*sic*] Trebitsch [...]', *Isle of Man Weekly Times* 7 September 1907: 6f.

⁷⁹ For Vienna, see Burkhard Stangl, *Ethnologie im Ohr: Die Wirkungsgeschichte des Phonographen* (WUV — Wiener Universitäts Verlag, 2000). As regards Berlin, Artur Simon (ed.), *Das Berliner Phonogramm-Archiv 1900–2000: Sammlungen der traditionellen Musik der Welt* (VWB — Verlag für Wissenschaft und Bildung, 2000).

and Scotland.⁸⁰ Trebitsch visited the Island in 1907, and again in 1909,⁸¹ as the Society's report for that year mentioned:

He [*i.e.* A.W. Moore] mentioned that a very distinguished Austrian Professor paid a short visit to the Island in the spring of the year. He was particularly interested in Manx music and Manx language. He (the Speaker) introduced the Professor to Mr Moore, Mr Nelson, and others, and enabled him to take away with him half-a-dozen tunes on phonograph records, which were to be published in a volume of music of European nations.⁸²

The recordings he made in 1907 are lost, and there seems to be no record of what was recorded, but those from 1909 are to be found in the Phonogrammarchiv in Vienna.⁸³ There is a puzzle though over his 1909 visit. The Society's report that year was dated 23 March, a change from the usual proceedings of the Hollantide (11 November) meeting being printed as the annual report; however, Trebitsch's documentation of his recording sessions are dated to August 1909. It is surprising also that just the visit from 1909 is mentioned and not the one

⁸⁰ His field recordings from the various Celtic countries have recently been released. Gerda Lechleitner and Ulla Remmer, eds, *The Collections of Rudolf Trebitsch: Celtic Recordings—Ireland, Wales, Brittany, Isle of Man, and Scotland (1907–09)*, vol. 5/2 (Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, 2003). Incidentally, Trebitsch also mentions a difficulty with potential informants, namely their lack of teeth.... Ulla Remmer, 'Rudolf Trebitsch and the Celtic Languages', *The Collections of Rudolf Trebitsch: Celtic Recordings—Ireland, Wales, Brittany, Isle of Man, and Scotland (1907–09)*, eds. Gerda Lechleitner and Ulla Remmer, vol. 5/2, Sound Documents from the Phonogrammarchiv of the Austrian Academy of Sciences: The Complete Historical Collections 1899—1950 (Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, 2003), 18a.

⁸¹ Remmer, 'Rudolf Trebitsch and the Celtic Languages', 21b. For Trebitsch's own report, see Rudolf Trebitsch, 'Phonographische Aufnahmen der Welschen Sprache in Wales, der Manxschen Sprache auf der Insel Man, der Gälischen Sprache in Schottland und eines Musikinstrumentes in Schottland', *Anzeiger der Kaiserlichen Akademie der Wissenschaften (Philosophisch-Historische Klasse)* xlv (1909): 170.

⁸² Manx Language Society, 'Annual Meeting', *Annual Meeting of the Manx Language Society, held in the Librarian's Room, Public Library, Douglas, on Thursday, November 22, 1906* (Manx Language Society, 1906): 6.

⁸³ Austrian Academy of Sciences, Phonogrammarchiv, Ph. 1072, 1088–96. Now issued on CD as OEAW PHA CD 14/2, see tracks 11–20.

from 1907; nor for that matter is there any mention in the newspapers bar the one reference given above.

From his time in the Island, Trebitsch mentions by name only Dr John Clague: 'Eine Gesellschaft hat es zum Teil über Anregung eines gewissen Dr Cragh [Clague] aus Castletown übernommen, mittelst des Edisonphonographen Proben dieses absterbenden Idioms zu sammeln und soll bereits gegen hundert derartige besitzen'.⁸⁴ While Clague had rejected the phonograph, he clearly made use of it as Trebitsch noted and Edmund Goodwin wrote to Morrison in 1909, the year after Clague's death, that 'Dr Clague's [phonograph] Manx records must be interesting & of real value'.⁸⁵ In his obituary in the *British Medical Journal* in 1908, it was mentioned that 'he took great interest in the Manx Language Society, and during the last few years was busily engaged in taking gramophones of Manx speech and song'.⁸⁶ This notice was most likely written by the Rev. John Kewley who knew Clague well.⁸⁷

Trebitsch recorded not in the field but in Douglas, the Island's capital, and those brought to him were enthusiasts for Manx, rather than native speakers themselves, as he shrewdly realised: 'Meist haben sie sogar zu allererst englisch und erst später Manx gelernt'.⁸⁸ (Most of them learned English first and Manx later). This was a missed opportunity, both for Trebitsch to be directed to native speakers of Manx to record, and to become personally

⁸⁴ Trebitsch, 'Phonographische Aufnahmen der Welschen Sprache in Wales, der Manxschen Sprache auf der Insel Man, der Gälischen Sprache in Schottland und eines Musikinstrumentes in Schottland', 170. Partly at the suggestion of a certain Dr Cragh [Clague] from Castletown, a society has undertaken to collect samples of this dying idiom using the Edison phonograph and is said to already possess around a hundred such samples.

⁸⁵ Letter from Edmund Goodwin to Sophia Morrison, 14 September 1909, MNHL, MS 09702, Box 2.

⁸⁶ Anon [but Rev. John Kewley], '[Obituary] John Clague, M.R.C.S, L.R.C.P, Castletown, Isle of Man', *British Medical Journal* 12 September 1908: 777b.

⁸⁷ His 'Introduction' from 1911, to Clague's posthumously published *Cooïnaghtyn Manninagh: Manx Reminiscences*, reads similar. Rev. John Kewley, 'Introduction', *Cooïnaghtyn Manninagh: Manx Reminiscences By the Late Dr John Clague* (M.J. Backwell, n.d. [but 1911]).

⁸⁸ Trebitsch, 'Phonographische Aufnahmen der Welschen Sprache in Wales, der Manxschen Sprache auf der Insel Man, der Gälischen Sprache in Schottland und eines Musikinstrumentes in Schottland', 170.

acquainted with Morrison herself. She was an occasional housekeeper for one of her brothers who was a medical doctor in Manchester, and it is possible that she was simply not present in the Island when he visited.

The Manx Language Society and the Phonograph (1904-1913)

Just as Trebitsch provides a puzzle of sorts, so too does the Manx Language Society's phonograph. The purchasing of blank cylinders is listed in the yearly expenditure of the Society from 1904 until 1908, with smaller numbers of cylinders bought over the years: £1 16s. 0d. was spent initially, followed by 11s. 6d. in the Report for 1906,⁸⁹ (the 1907 Report never appeared),⁹⁰ 8s. 1d. in 1908,⁹¹ and, finally, just 5s. 6d. in 1909.⁹² After the 1909 report, no further expenditure is listed. That said, Morrison wrote to Kneen in 1913, 'I am hoping you will be able to use the M.L.S. Phonograph during the winter'.⁹³ The annual report the following month mentioned that 'Mr Kneen has also the society's phonograph in Port Erin for the winter in order to store up records of Manx speech and song. Anyone who knows of a good unpublished Manx song should communicate with him'.⁹⁴ And here from *Mannin*,

⁸⁹ Manx Language Society, 'Balance Sheet from Hollantide, 1905, to Hollantide, 1906', *Annual Meeting of the Manx Language Society, held in the Librarian's Room, Public Library, Douglas, on Thursday, November 22, 1906* (Manx Language Society, 1906).

⁹⁰ 'Report not printed for 1907', penciled annotation on the cover of Manx Language Society, *Sixteenth Annual Meeting held in the Town Hall, Douglas, on Hollantide Day, 1915* (Manx Language Society, 1915).

⁹¹ Manx Language Society, 'Balance Sheet from Hollantide 1906, to Hollantide, 1907', *Annual Meeting of the Manx Language Society, held in Empire House, Promenade, Douglas, on Tuesday, March 24th, 1908* (Manx Language Society, 1908).

⁹² Manx Language Society, 'Balance Sheet from Hollantide 1907, to Hollantide, 1908', *Annual Meeting of the Manx Language Society, held in Empire House, Central Promenade, Douglas, on Tuesday, March 23th, 1909* (Manx Language Society, 1909).

⁹³ Letter from Sophia Morrison to J.J. Kneen, 14 September 1913, MNHL, MS 1086/36 C.

⁹⁴ Anon, 'The Manx Society: Annual Meeting', *Manx Quarterly* 13 (1913): 96b–97a.

The Manx Language Society's phonograph is still hard at work. In the past it has stored up much of Manx song and speech, which otherwise might have been lost. Even should the spoken language die out altogether, which Heaven forefend, it will be possible for future generations to hear the pure old Manx enunciation. Mr Kneen will have the phonograph this winter at Port Erin.⁹⁵

This is puzzling, given that expenditure by the Society on cylinders ends in 1909. The Society's minute books do not provide any background. Remarkably, no minutes were recorded for the Executive or Committee meetings for 1906 through 1908, and while the minutes of both committees do exist for 1909, the last year in which the Society are recorded as purchasing cylinders, there is no record of any debate about the continuance — or abeyance for that matter — of the recording program.⁹⁶ On another tack, there are no mentions of the phonograph in Morrison's annual reports as Secretary, after the one here in the 1906 report:

Before passing on to the social events of the past year, I must not forget to mention the work accomplished by an inanimate member of this Society. I mean the phonograph. Many most interesting records have been obtained from Manx speakers, and various paragraphs have appeared in the English Press commending the idea of thus preserving the native sounds, and quoting us as a good example.

⁹⁵ Sophia Morrison, 'Notes', *Mannin* 2 (1913), 60.

⁹⁶ Manx Language Society Minute Book (1899–1913), Thie ny Gaelgey, Yn Çheshaght Ghailckagh archive.

We hope that during the coming winter the phonograph will pay visits to those parts of the Island to which it has not yet been sent.⁹⁷

This is very curious, as the annual reports do all cover in depth the activities of the Society. Morrison's correspondence with Kneen survives with letters in number but there is no mention in them of any issue connected with the Society's phonograph.

'No loss, 'jus' boghtynid'

Agnes Wicksey, the schoolmistress of Baaregarroo in the parish of German, recorded in the school logbook for 1874: 'Singing not so good; one boy, who has been converted at the 'revival meetings' held in this Chapel at the present time, refused to sing school songs, as he thought it wrong to do so'.⁹⁸ Methodist revivals were a feature of Island life in the nineteenth century. For example, Croit-e-Caley Chapel in Rushen parish had revival meetings that lasted nine to ten weeks in the years 1866, 1872, 1876, and 1890.⁹⁹ The result of this was, as A.W. Moore noted in his *Manx Ballads and Music* (1896), '[t]o this day a score of Manx men will know one or more Manx sacred songs for every one that knows a Manx secular song'.¹⁰⁰

Sophia Morrison collected 'Arrane Sooree' ('Courting Song') from Joseph Moore of Dalby, and she commented that, while he once knew twelve or thirteen verses of it, 'now he remembers the first verse & the chorus which came after each verse'.¹⁰¹ Moore attempted to

⁹⁷ Sophia Morrison, 'Secretary's Report', *Annual Meeting of the Manx Language Society, held in the Librarian's Room, Public Library, Douglas, on Thursday, November 22, 1906* (Manx Language Society, 1906), 6.

⁹⁸ Entry for week of 9–13 March 1874, Baaregarroo School logbook, German, MNHL, MD 10025. The entry for the following week, 16–20 March 1874, read: 'Kept some of the second class boys in to do their home exercises, & made them understand that if they are attending the evening meetings at the chapel, they must not for that reason neglect their home & school duties'.

⁹⁹ 'Records of Revivals', 7 & 9, in Rev. J.K. E[lliott], J.R. C[orin] and W.E. C[ollister], *Primitive Methodist Church. Croit-e-Caley. Castletown Circuit. Jubilee Souvenir 1881–1931* (n.pub, n.d. [but 1931]).

¹⁰⁰ A.W. Moore, 'Introduction', *Manx Ballads and Music* (Douglas: G. & R. Johnson, 1896), xv.

¹⁰¹ 'Manx Fragments of Music', undated, hand of Sophia Morrison, MNHL, MS 09495, Box 7.

find others who could recollect more of the song than he could but to no avail. 'However, he tried to console me by saying that the missing verses were 'no loss, 'jus' [just] boghtynid'. Cregeen glosses *boghtynid* as meaning 'poverty, poorness'¹⁰² with Kelly the same sense, 'poverty, need'.¹⁰³ Moore is using it here in the notion of 'rubbish', and that the missing verses were no great loss. This was not the only time that Morrison encountered this feeling. When reporting to the Society in 1905 about the activities of the recently purchased phonograph, she mentioned a major problem she had encountered in collecting material:

One difficulty in the way of obtaining the material which we want, has been, as I have found by experience, the unwillingness of our intensely earnest and religious peasantry to speak into the instrument such 'boghtynid' as folk-stories and sayings and secular songs. They prefer that such a serious thing as a record which is to be handed down to posterity shall consist of Hymns, Scripture, or Carvals.¹⁰⁴

She went to add, '[o]ne who knows them can understand the feeling, but, for the purposes of the M.L.S. more frivolity is to be desired'. One of the collectors, namely John Nelson, also shared this view. As Morrison wrote to Kneen in 1905, after having failed to encourage him to produce some learning materials for the Society:

I have done my best to persuade Nelson to give us some every day jig-jog yarns in homely Manx — but he looks upon that kind of work as just so much

¹⁰² Archibald Cregeen, *A Dictionary of the Manks Language* (Douglas & London & Liverpool: J. Quiggin & Whittaker, Treacher, and Arnot & Evans, Chegwin, and Hall, 1835 [but 1837]). 27a.

¹⁰³ Rev. William Gill, ed, *The Manx Dictionary in Two Parts* (Manx Society, 1866), 26b.

¹⁰⁴ Morrison, 'The Secretary's Report', 4.

'boghtynid' — his one ambition being to translate Moody & Sankey. It is such a pity as we have so much of that wishy washy stuff in Manx—& of no real value'.¹⁰⁵

Sacred Songs and Solos compiled by Ira Sankey, was first published in 1873, and subsequently later went through numerous editions and formats.

'I am sending you a Box Containing 8 broken records'

'I am sending you a Box Containing 8 broken records, & 4 cut records which has some blemish's on, and they are not to my mind satisfactory to leave for after generations to hear', wrote John Nelson to William Cubbon in 1906.¹⁰⁶ The quality of the cylinders themselves was the problem, though Nelson and the Society had also neglected to purchase a cleaner. The cylinders were recordings of religious texts, most likely ones recited by Nelson himself. Cubbon, at this date, was the librarian of the Douglas Borough Public Library, later moving to the newly-founded Manx Museum as Secretary and Librarian in 1922. These cylinders were left in the library until 1955, when they were transferred to the Manx Museum.¹⁰⁷ This is all that now survives from the new ally. In 1925, J.J. Kneen, now Secretary of the Society, commented on a proposal by the nascent Manx Museum to intitiate its own sound recording programme that '[t]he Manx Society did acquire a phonograph some years ago, but as the

¹⁰⁵ Letter from Sophia Morrison to J.J. Kneen, 22 November 1905, MNHL, MS 1086/13 c. Nelson was later in 1906 to have own column in the *Ramsey Courier* where this material was to appear; for his first contribution, see John Nelson, 'Manx Column', *Ramsey Courier* 3 August 1906, [3]b.

¹⁰⁶ Letter from John Nelson to William Cubbon, 28 November 1906, MNHL, MS 5606 a.

¹⁰⁷ Deposited as iommm 1955–0344. Information taken from (presumably) a letter from the Douglas Borough Public Librarian, E.F. Ladds, 8 September 1955, summarised on a typed top-sheet present (as photocopy) with MNHL, MS 5606 A.

impressions were only in wax, the records would not be of an enduring nature'.¹⁰⁸ Kneen was, as seen, part of that initiative and his distanced phrasing here suggests that he had little idea as to what had happened to the cylinder collection.

'Dr Burchardi wishes to borrow M.L.S. Phonograph Records'

'Dr Burchardi wishes to borrow M.L.S. Phonograph Records', wrote Morrison to Kneen in an undated letter, but which must be from 1912.¹⁰⁹ This is Gustav Burchardi (1866–?), a Sankristist, who had visited the Island in 1910, where he told Morrison, 'I am reading Manx every afternoon with Mr Moore',¹¹⁰ in a letter sent from Port Erin. This is the Thomas Moore of 'Brookfield', where the 1905 recording session took place. Burchardi had written to Morrison in early 1912 about access to the Society's cylinders:

I have for instance asked Mr Moore in Port Erin to let me have some phonograph records. That was nearly a year ago, but do you think that I ever got them though they been promised to me I really do not know how often. I have asked him now to let me know if I shall get them or not or in the latter case I must try to get them from somewhere else.¹¹¹

Cyril Paton, an English naturalist and language enthusiast who made annual visits to the Island from London, visited Moore in 1909, and recorded in his diary for 18 June that

¹⁰⁸ J.J. Kneen, 'The Secretary's Report', *26th Annual Meeting held in the Town Hall, Douglas, on Saturday, Nov. 14th, 1925* (Manx Language Society, 1925), 6.

¹⁰⁹ Letter from Sophia Morrison to J.J. Kneen, undated [but 1912], MNHL, MS 1513/p B.

¹¹⁰ Letter from Gustav Burchardi to Sophia Morrison, 26 September 1910, MNHL, MS 09495, Sophia Morrison Papers, Box 1.

¹¹¹ Letter from Gustav Burchardi to Sophia Morrison, 10 January 1912, MNHL, MS 09495, Sophia Morrison Papers, Box 1.

year, 'Mr & Mrs. Moore phonos of Ld's prayer 13th. of [*unreadable*] Herring fleet Ellen vannin hymn'.¹¹² These are (respectively) recordings of the Lord's Prayer, I Corinthians 13, 'The Wreck of the Herring Fleet' (a well-known Manx folk song), 'Ellan Vannin' ('Isle of Man'), a popular composition taken as an unofficial Manx National Anthem, and a religious hymn. These can be seen to be a number of the cylinders recorded in 1905 at 'Brookfield'.

Cylinders remained then in at least one set of personal hands, as is also to be seen in a letter from 1914, when Morrison wrote to Josephine Kermode (the Manx poet 'Cushag', who accompanied her when collecting), concerning an untitled tune Frances Corlett *née* Proctor had collected:

Mrs Corlett sung it for me — it is indeed a lovely air. She said many years ago Dr Clague sung it into old Mr Moore's phonograph — he said that his father had sung it to him when a tiny child. Recently Mrs Corlett went to Mr Moore's & took the air down from his record.¹¹³

In 1934, the Ward Library in Peel was gifted 'a handsome bookcase by Miss Morrison in memory of her sister the late Miss Sophia Morrison',¹¹⁴ her papers remaining in family hands until 1958 when, what had survived from their removal after her sister's death, were deposited in the then Manx Museum Library, but personal papers only, and no cylinders.

¹¹² Cyril I. Paton, *Diary*, entry for 18 June 1909. In *Private Hands*.

¹¹³ Letter from Sophia Morrison to Josephine Kermode, 8 November 1914, MNHL, MS 08979, Kermode Family papers.

¹¹⁴ Anon, 'Presentation to Peel. Memorial to Late Miss Sophia Morrison', *Peel City Guardian*, 28 April, 1934: Unpagged Supplement [1]–[2]. The bookcase made of oak remains in place, the inscription over the top reading 'In Memory of Sophia Morrison'.

'As wax cylinders break so easily'

'Of course for the purpose of securing records for 'future generations' it will be necessary to have permanent metal moulds made of [from] the wax 'masters'.¹¹⁵ This is not Sophia Morrison, but William Cole in a letter written to her in 1907, and sent from Essex where he lived. As George List has written, '[c]ylinder records in most cases were made of a relatively soft wax mixture. For this reason the grooves wear very rapidly with repeated playback. Thus, a cylinder recording is often irretrievably ruined by the time the speech or music recorded is transcribed'.¹¹⁶ Cylinders could be reproduced in this period, as referred to in the letter by the Galvano process, as was used at the Berlin Phonogrammarchiv from 1902 and onwards.¹¹⁷ Berlin was soon being sent cylinders to copy and thereby safeguarded.¹¹⁸ The Vienna Phonogrammarchiv also developed a mechanical system for dubbing from cylinder to disk.¹¹⁹ Trebitsch was seen visiting the Island twice, and yet no link was established between the Phonogrammarchiv of Vienna or Berlin and the Society that can be seen.

There were even concerns and hazards before playing back a cylinder: 'Today I had the records and the unused cylinder carefully packed and sent to you [carriage paid.] I hope they will arrive unbroken'. This was the English folk song collector, George B. Gardiner (1852–1910), writing to Ralph Vaughan Williams (1872–1958) in 1909,¹²⁰ continuing, '[o]ne

¹¹⁵ Letter from William Cole to Sophia Morrison, 7 August 1907, MNHL, MS 09495, Sophia Morrison Papers, Box 5.

¹¹⁶ George List, 'The Reproduction of Cylinder Recordings [Part 1]', *The Folklore and Folk Music Archivist* i, no. 4 (1958), [2]a. Often a feature of articles on early sound recordings is photographs of damaged and cracked cylinders; for example, see Drago Kunej, 'The Phonograph has arrived': History of the Wax Cylinder Sound Collection from Bela krajina', *Jahrbuch des Österreichischen Volksliedwerkes* 53–54 (2004–05): 175, 177.

¹¹⁷ List, 'The Reproduction of Cylinder Recordings [Part 1]', [1]a–[2]b. Further, see Martin Clayton, 'Ethnographic Wax Cylinders at the British Library National Sound Archives: A Brief History and Description of the Collection', *British Journal of Ethnomusicology* 5 (1996): 80–83.

¹¹⁸ Clayton, 'Ethnographic Wax Cylinders at the British Library National Sound Archives: A Brief History and Description of the Collection', 80–83.

¹¹⁹ List, 'The Reproduction of Cylinder Recordings [Part 1]', [1]a.

¹²⁰ Letter from George Gardiner to Ralph Vaughan Williams, 14 January 1909, Vaughan Williams Memorial Library (hereafter VWML), RVW 1 120.

cylinder broke in my bag and one at Basingstoke W'. Ella Leather (1874–1928), another collector and correspondent with Vaughan Williams, recounted the year before in 1908, how at one recording session, 'Hancocks leaned on the horn & afterwards broke the record'.¹²¹ She had faced other difficulties as well, 'Mrs Harris has no more voice & Mrs Powell was very shaky & I think in Pretty Caroline she shook the table'.

William Cole (1844–1922) was the founder of the Essex Field Club in 1880, and in 1905, F.W. Rudler described him as being 'much interested in talking machines', as he phrased it.¹²² As George William wrote, 'Cole was a pioneer in many fields. For example in the early 1900s he was recording voices using a horn phonograph and wax cylinders. It is fascinating to conjecture that some of these may have survived [...]'.¹²³ What is a puzzle is how Cole and Morrison came to know of each other. Cole's letter was dated 7 August 1907, and the *Isle of Man Times* from 28 September, carried a report of the recent Pan-Celtic Congress held in Edinburgh, where Morrison reported that:

Since the last Congress, the M.L.S. has purchased a phonograph, with the object of storing up Manx records of speech and song in various parts of the Island (Applause.) We are using an Edison 'Home' phonograph, and have made many successful experiments in recording. We intend to provide our instrument with a fitted arm and carbon diaphragm, and join in buying some metal moulds for future generations, as wax cylinders break so easily (Applause.)¹²⁴

¹²¹ Letter from Ella Leather to Ralph Vaughan Williams, 9 November 1908, VWML, RVW 1 115.

¹²² F.W. Rudler, 'On Natural History Museums: An Address delivered to the Essex Field Club at the Annual Meeting, April 8th, 1905', *Essex Naturalist* xiv (1905): 37.

¹²³ William George, 'William Cole (1844–1922): Founder of the Essex Field Club', *Essex Naturalist (New Series)* 17 (2000): 28.

¹²⁴ Anon, 'Pan-Celtic Congress at Edinburgh', *Isle of Man Times*, 28 September, 1907, 9b–c.

Cole suggested that there be a joint approach by the Essex Field Club and the Manx Language Society in securing permanent copies of their cylinders. This did not happen, certainly from the Manx side, and as with Trebitsch was another missed opportunity for cooperation.

Endnote

This was not to be the end of the story of the recording of Manx.¹²⁵ The Norwegian Celticist, Carl Marstrander (1883–1965), Professor of Celtic Studies at Oslo, visited the Island in 1929 and 1930, and later again in 1933, where he made fifty-four cylinder recordings from six native speakers, the majority from Harry Kelly of Cregneash in the south of the Island.¹²⁶ The visit by Éamon de Valera, Taoiseach of the Republic of Ireland, to the Isle of Man in 1947, led to the visit of the Irish Folklore Commission the following year and a series of recordings made from the now dwindling number of speakers.¹²⁷ The coming of the Commission inspired the Manx Language Society, now known as Yn Çheshaght Ghailckagh, to carry on collecting — and not for the first time — after the IFC left, this time with wax replaced by tape.¹²⁸

In 1893, A.W. Moore wrote to Karl Roeder (1848–1911), a German national resident in Manchester and a collector of Manx folklore, that 'I feel that if anything were to happen to

¹²⁵ For an overview, George [as 'Shorys y Creayrie'] Broderick, 'Recording Native Manx Speech', *For a Celtic Future: A Tribute to Alan Heusaff*, ed. Cathal Ó Luain (The Celtic League, n.d. [but 1983]).

¹²⁶ George Broderick, 'Prof. Carl J. S. Marstrander and the Manx Cylinder Recordings 1933: The Irish Connection', *Proceedings of the Sixteenth Symposium of Societas Celtologica Nordica*, eds. Cathinka Hambro Dahl and Eystein Dahl (Uppsala universitet, 2024). For an overview, Broderick, 'Recording Native Manx Speech'.

¹²⁷ Manx National Heritage, *Skeelalyn Vannin: Stories of Mann. The Complete Collection of Manx Language Archive Recordings made by the Irish Folklore Commission in 1948* (Manx National Heritage, 2003).

¹²⁸ For the recollections of one of those involved, Walter Clarke (1928–2007), <https://culturevannin.im/watchlisten/audioarchive/walter-clarke-the-old-manx-speakers/>

me, print is much safer than MS'.¹²⁹ In this, he was prescient, as all that now survives of his antiquarian (and other) endeavours is a single notebook, somewhat appropriately titled *Manx 'Odds & Ends'*, and some proof-sheets of the tunes that appeared in *Manx Ballads and Music*. 'It was a staggering blow in many senses', wrote Roeder in a letter to Morrison in 1908, referring to the loss of his own personal papers and recounted the circumstances:

As I said, I had collected a multitude of material for that purpose, but since my long last illness, 3 years ago, when all my things were removed & packed away & stored, many of my books, & notes were lost & dispersed, by bad management of the wretched removers, & are irrecoverably gone, also with [other] valuable papers, maps, plans & what not.¹³⁰

And this pair were not the only ones in this period to suffer the loss of personal papers as it befell others in their circle.¹³¹

All these collectors faced the issue of how to record, in tangible form, the intangibles of an oral expressive culture; with awareness in the case of Moore, or happenstance as regards Roeder, the record itself they created was as equally under threat of loss as the folklore and folk songs they were collecting. The Rev. E.B. Savage, in his 1905 Presidential Address to the Manx Language Society, spoke of the phonograph in these terms: 'Our phonograph will preserve the speech and accent of Manx people of this

¹²⁹ Letter from A.W. Moore to Karl Roeder, 30 November 1893, Manchester Central Library, Manchester City Archives, M277/12/1–65.

¹³⁰ Letter from Karl Roeder to Sophia Morrison, MNHL, MS 09495, Sophia Morrison Papers, Box 6.

¹³¹ Stephen Miller, 'Print is Much Safer than MS': The Fate of Folklore and Folk Song Collections in the Isle of Man, *KULA: Knowledge Creation, Dissemination, and Preservation Studies* 2 (2018).

generation, from different parts of the Island'.¹³² As seen, this was not the case, but not for want of trying. The Society's phonograph itself has been preserved and sits now in a museum in Peel,¹³³ the hometown of Sophia Morrison, as a mute testament to what is a remarkable episode in the early years of collecting and recording with the phonograph.

¹³² Canon Ernest B. Savage, 'The President's Address', *Annual Meeting, 1905* (n.p.: Manx Language Society, 1905) 2.

¹³³ Its inventory number is IOMMM 1954–6335.

Bibliography

Abercromby, John. 'The International Congress of Folklore in Paris'. *Folk-lore* xi, no. 4 (1900): 427–33.

Anon. '[Douglas] A Talk about Electricity'. *Isle of Man Examiner*, 25 February, 1899.

———. 'Wesleyan Bazaar'. *Peel City Guardian*, 8 April, 1899.

———. 'Jurby's population ...'. *Isle of Man Examiner*, 18 August, 1900.

———. 'Sale of Peel Fishing Boats'. *Peel City Guardian*, 7 July, 1900.

———. 'Manx Language Society: Annual Meeting'. *Manx Sun*, 14 December, 1901.

———. 'Phonographic Records of Folk-Songs'. *Journal of American Folklore* 14, no. 55 (1901): 313.

———. 'The Manx Language in Peel'. *Peel City Guardian*, 27 September, 1902.

———. 'The Manx Language Society'. *Manx Sun*, 15 November, 1902.

———. 'Manx Language Society'. *Isle of Man Examiner*, 15 November, 1902.

———. 'Sale of Peel Boats'. *Peel City Guardian*, 27 September, 1902.

———. 'Gramophone Manx Records'. *Peel City Guardian*, 15 April, 1905.

———. 'The Manx Language and the Phonograph'. *Isle of Man Times*, 15 April, 1905.

———. 'Dr Adolf [*sic*] Trebitsch [...]'. *Isle of Man Weekly Times*, 7 September, 1907.

———. 'Pan-Celtic Congress at Edinburgh'. *Isle of Man Times*, 28 September, 1907.

———. '[Memorial Notices] John Sansbury. Died July 9th, 1908'. *Manx Quarterly* 5 (1908): 494.

———. 'The Manx Society: Annual Meeting'. *Manx Quarterly* 13 (1913): 85–99.

———. 'Presentation to Peel. Memorial to Late Miss Sophia Morrison'. *Peel City Guardian*, 28 April, 1934.

Anon [but Rev. John Kewley]. '[Obituary] John Clague, M.R.C.S, L.R.C.P, Castletown, Isle

- of Man'. *British Medical Journal*, 12 September, 1908.
- Bassin, Ethel. 'Lucy Broadwood 1858–1929: Her Contribution to the Collection and Study of Gaelic Traditional Song'. *Scottish Studies* 9 (1965): 145–52.
- Bearman, C.J. 'Percy Grainger, the Phonograph, and the Folk Song Society'. *Music & Letters* 84, no. 3 (2003): 434–55.
- Belchem, John. 'The Little Manx Nation: Antiquarianism, Ethnic Identity, and Home Rule Politics in the Isle of Man, 1880–1918'. *Journal of British Studies* 39, no. 2 (2000): 217–40.
- . 'The Onset of Modernity, 1830–80'. *The Modern Period: 1830–1999*. Vol. 5. A New History of the Isle of Man. Liverpool University Press, 2000.
- Bennett, Joseph. 'Facts, Rumours, and Remarks'. *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular* 39, no. 661 (1898): 167–69.
- Brady, Erika. *A Spiral Way: How the Phonograph Changed Ethnography*. University Press of Mississippi, 1999.
- Broadwood, Lucy E. 'Folk-Songs and Music'. *Folk-lore* iii, no. 4 (1892): 551–53.
- Broderick, George. 'Manx Stories and Reminiscences of Ned Beg Hom Ruy'. *Zeitschrift für celtische Philologie* 38 (1981): 113–78.
- . 'Manx Stories and Reminiscences of Ned Beg Hom Ruy: Translation and Notes'. *Zeitschrift für celtische Philologie* 39 (1982): 117–94.
- . *Language Death in the Isle of Man*. Niemeyer, 1999.
- . 'Prof. Carl J. S. Marstrander and the Manx Cylinder Recordings 1933: The Irish Connection'. *Proceedings of the Sixteenth Symposium of Societas Celtologica Nordica*. Eds. Hambro Dahl, Cathinka and Eystein Dahl. Uppsala universitet,

2024. 172–80.

Broderick, George [as 'Shorys y Creayrie']. 'Recording Native Manx Speech'. *For a Celtic Future: A Tribute to Alan Heusaff*, edited by Ó Luain, Cathal. The Celtic League, n.d. [but 1983].

Cain, Joseph, and William Kneen. *Yn Chied Lioar Gailckagh*. Douglas: n.pub, 1898.

Clarke, T. Kingston. *The 'Widda-Man'*. Archibald Constable, 1907.

Clayton, Martin. 'Ethnographic Wax Cylinders at the British Library National Sound Archives: A Brief History and Description of the Collection'. *British Journal of Ethnomusicology* 5 (1996): 67–92.

Commissariat Royal Hongrois. '[Groupe III. Instruments et procédés généraux des lettres, des sciences et des arts] Classe 17. Instruments de musique'. *Exposition Universelle de 1900 à Paris. Catalogue Special. Exposition des Pays de la Couronne Hongrois*. Commissariat Royal Hongrois, 1900.

Cregeen, Archibald. *A Dictionary of the Manks Language*. Douglas & London & Liverpool: J. Quiggin & Whittaker, Treacher, and Arnot & Evans, Chegwin, and Hall, 1835 [but 1837].

Dodgson, E.S. 'Some Inscriptions in the Gaelic of Mann'. *Manx Church Magazine* xi, no. 10 (1901): cxxviii a–cxxx.

E[lliott], Rev. J.K, J.R. C[orrin], and W.E. C[ollister]. *Primitive Methodist Church. Croit-e-Caley. Castletown Circuit. Jubilee Souvenir 1881—1931*. n.pub, n.d. [but 1931].

Exposition Internationale Universelle de 1900. '[Groupe III. Classe 17. Instruments de Musique. Pays Étrangers] Hongrie'. *Catalogue Général Officiel. Groupe III. Instruments et procédés généraux des lettres, des sciences et des arts. Classes 11 à 18*.

- Vol. 3. Imprimeries Lemercier & L. Danel, 1900. 40–41.
- Gammon, Vic. 'Folk Song Collecting in Sussex and Surrey, 1843–1914'. *History Workshop Journal* 10 (1980): 61–89.
- George, William. 'William Cole (1844–1922): Founder of the Essex Field Club'. *Essex Naturalist (New Series)* 17 (2000): 21–30.
- Gibbs, Alan, and C.J. Bearman. 'Percy Grainger and the Phonograph'. *Music & Letters* 85, no. 3 (2004): 516.
- Gill, Rev. William, ed. *The Manx Dictionary in Two Parts*. Douglas: Manx Society, 1866.
- Gill, W.H. 'Manx Music: A Sketch'. *Manx National Music: Selected from the MS. Collection of the Deemster J.F. Gill, Dr J. Clague, and W.H. Gill, and Arranged by W.H. Gill*. London: Boosey, 1898. v–x.
- Graf, Walter. 'The Phonogrammarchiv der Österreichischen Akademie der Wissenschaften in Vienna'. *The Folklore and Folk Music Archivist* 4, no. 4 (1962): [1] & [3]–[4].
- Grainger, Percy. 'Collecting with the Phonograph'. *Journal of the Folk Song Society* iii, no. 12 (1908): 147–242.
- H.M. Government. *Census—1901: Islands in the British Seas*. Cd. 1473. HMSO, 1903.
- James, E. Wyn. 'An 'English' lady among the Welsh folk: Ruth Herbert Lewis and the Welsh Folk-Song Society'. *Folk Song: Tradition, Revival, and Re-Creation*. Eds. Russell, Ian and David Atkinson. The Elphinstone Institute, University of Aberdeen, 2004. 266–83.
- Jones, David R. 'Lady Ruth Herbert Lewis (1871—1946): Indefatigable Collector of Flintshire's Folk-Songs'. *Flintshire Historical Society Journal* 37 (2007): 106–67.
- Kewley, Rev. John. 'Introduction'. *Cooïnaghtyn Manninagh: Manx Reminiscences By the*

- Late Dr John Clague*. M.J. Backwell, n.d. [but 1911]. ix–xi.
- Kneen, J.J. 'The Secretary's Report'. *26th Annual Meeting held in the Town Hall, Douglas, on Saturday, Nov. 14th, 1925*. Manx Language Society, 1925. 2–7.
- Kunej, Drago. 'The Phonograph has arrived': History of the Wax Cylinder Sound Collection from Bela krajina'. *Jahrbuch des Österreichischen Volksliedwerkes* 53–54 (2004–05): 170–80.
- . 'We have plenty of words written down; We need melodies!': The Purchase of the First Recording Device for Ethnomusicological Research in Slovenia'. *Traditiones* 34, no. 1 (2005): 125–40.
- Lechleitner, Gerda, and Ulla Remmer, eds. *The Collections of Rudolf Trebitsch: Celtic Recordings—Ireland, Wales, Brittany, Isle of Man, and Scotland (1907–09)*. Vol. 5/2. Vienna: Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, 2003.
- Lewis, Ruth Herbert. 'Welsh and Manx Folk Songs'. *Transactions of the Celtic Congress, 1921*. Ed. D. Rhys Phillips. Swansea, 1923. 165–67.
- Lineff, Eugénie. 'Psalms and Religious Songs of Russian Sectarians in the Caucasus'. *Report of the Fourth Congress of the International Musical Society, London, 29th May —3rd June, 1911*. London: Novello and Company, 1912. 187–201.
- List, George. 'The Reproduction of Cylinder Recordings [Part 1]'. *The Folklore and Folk Music Archivist* i.4 (1958): [2]–[3].
- Manx Language Society. *Annual Meeting November 12, 1902*. n.p.: n.pub. [but Manx Language Society], 1902.
- . 'Recording Manx Speakers and Singers'. *Annual Report. Hollantide, 1904*. n.p.: Manx Language Society, 1904. 7–8.
- . 'Balance Sheet from Hollantide 1904, to Hollantide, 1905'. *Annual Meeting*,

1905. n.p.: Manx Language Society, 1905. 7.
- . 'Records of the Manx Language'. *Annual Meeting, 1905*. n.p.: Manx Language Society, 1905. 8.
- . 'Annual Meeting'. *Annual Meeting of the Manx Language Society, held in the Librarian's Room, Public Library, Douglas, on Thursday, November 22, 1906*. n.p.: Manx Language Society, 1906. 6.
- . 'Balance Sheet from Hollantide, 1905, to Hollantide, 1906'. *Annual Meeting of the Manx Language Society, held in the Librarian's Room, Public Library, Douglas, on Thursday, November 22, 1906*. n.p.: Manx Language Society, 1906. 3–4.
- . 'Balance Sheet from Hollantide 1906, to Hollantide, 1907'. *Annual Meeting of the Manx Language Society, held in Empire House, Promenade, Douglas, on Tuesday, March 24th, 1908*. Manx Language Society, 1908. 3.
- . 'Balance Sheet from Hollantide 1907, to Hollantide, 1908'. *Annual Meeting of the Manx Language Society, held in Empire House, Central Promenade, Douglas, on Tuesday, March 23rd, 1909*. Manx Language Society, 1909. 3.
- . *Sixteenth Annual Meeting held in the Town Hall, Douglas, on Hollantide Day, 1915*. Manx Language Society, 1915.

Manx National Heritage. *Skealyn Vannin: Stories of Mann. The Complete Collection of Manx Language Archive Recordings made by the Irish Folklore Commission in 1948*. Manx National Heritage, 2003.

Miller, Stephen. "Here the Manx language lingers and may linger some time longer": Manx and English in Cregneash in 1901'. *Zeitschrift für celtische Philologie* (2007): 108–21.

———. "Print is Much Safer than MS": The Fate of Folklore and Folk Song Collections

- in the Isle of Man'. *KULA: Knowledge Creation, Dissemination, and Preservation Studies* 2 (2018): 1–11.
- Moore, A.W. 'Introduction'. *Manx Ballads and Music*. Douglas: G. & R. Johnson, 1896. xiv–xxx.
- Morrison, Sophia. 'The Secretary's Report'. *Annual Report. Hollantide, 1904*Yn Cheshaght Ghailckagh, 1904. 2–6.
- . 'The Secretary's Report'. *Annual Meeting, 1905*. Manx Language Society, 1905. 3–7.
- . 'Secretary's Report'. *Annual Meeting of the Manx Language Society, held in the Librarian's Room, Public Library, Douglas, on Thursday, November 22, 1906*. Manx Language Society, 1906. 4–7.
- . '[The Taking of Evidence, iv. In the Isle of Man] Introduction'. *The Fairy Faith in Celtic Countries*. Oxford University Press, 1911. 117–20.
- . 'Notes'. *Mannin* 2 (1913): 57–60.
- Myers, Charles S. 'The Ethnological Study of Music'. *Anthropological Essays presented to Edward Burnett Tylor*. Ed. Thomas, Northcote W. Clarendon Press, 1907. 235–53.
- Nelson, John. 'Manx Column'. *Ramsey Courier*, 3 August, 1906.
- Pseud [signed as 'By Our Special Correspondent']. 'The Feis Ceoil at Belfast'. *The Musical Times and Singing Class Circular* 39, no. 664 (1898): 390a–92.
- Remmer, Ulla. 'Rudolf Trebitsch and the Celtic Languages'. *The Collections of Rudolf Trebitsch: Celtic Recordings—Ireland, Wales, Brittany, Isle of Man, and Scotland (1907–09)*. Eds. Lechleitner, Gerda and Ulla Remmer. Vol. 5/2. Sound Documents from the Phonogrammarchiv of the Austrian Academy of Sciences: The Complete Historical Collections 1899—1950. Österreichische Akademie der Wissenschaften, 2003. 16b–

23a.

Rudler, F.W. 'On Natural History Museums: An Address delivered to the Essex Field Club at the Annual Meeting, April 8th, 1905'. *Essex Naturalist* xiv (1905): 1–37.

Savage, Canon Ernest B. 'The President's Address'. *Annual Meeting, 1905* Manx Language Society, 1905. 1–3.

Simon, Artur, ed. *Das Berliner Phonogramm-Archiv 1900–2000: Sammlungen der traditionellen Musik der Welt*. VWB—Verlag für Wissenschaft und Bildung, 2000.

Stangl, Burkhard. *Ethnologie im Ohr: Die Wirkungsgeschichte des Phonographen*. WUV—Wiener Universitäts Verlag, 2000.

Terbócs, Attila. *Vikár Béla-bibliográfia*. Budapesti Finnugor Füzetek. Vol. 13. ELTE Finnugor Tanszék, 1999.

Trebitsch, Rudolf. 'Phonographische Aufnahmen der Welschen Sprache in Wales, der Manxschen Sprache auf der Insel Man, der Gälischen Sprache in Schottland und eines Musikinstrumentes in Schottland'. *Anzeiger der Kaiserlichen Akademie der Wissenschaften (Philosophisch-Historische Klasse)* xlv (1909): 156–80.

Yates, Michael. 'Percy Grainger and the Impact of the Phonograph'. *Folk Music Journal* 4, no. 3 (1982): 265–75.